

ILLUSTRATIVE EXAMPLES OF STRATEGIES TO REDUCE FRAGMENTATION IN POOLING

Dimensions	Political economy factors	Strategies used by reform teams	Examples
Interest group politics	Advocates for reform are not well organized and too weak to adopt and implement pooling reform	Build coalitions for reform favouring political leaders and other supporting civic groups, professional associations, labour unions to influence the design of reform proposals, garner public support and support implementation	Mexico, Korea
		Solidify the legitimacy of the pooling reform by showing public support for its technical aspects	
		Mobilize public support by linking the reforms to the broader social and political context	
		Enable a public policy making process that will allow participation of supporting interest groups in the adoption and implementation of the pooling reform	
Bureaucratic politics	Opposing interest groups organize against consolidation of pools	Undermine legitimacy or replace opposing workers with those from labour unions in support of the consolidation	Mexico, Turkey, Ghana
	Internal opposition from within the Ministry of Health	Settle interdepartmental conflicts in support of a single, unified view/message within the Ministry of Health	
	Existing social security institutions or line ministries block consolidation of revenue pools due to concerns over reduction in resources to their own institutions	Use favourable personal relationships with the Head of the Cabinet and other key Ministries and relevant institutions to garner support and block opposition's ability to influence the Legislature	
		Directly involve leaders from across other bureaucratic agencies to link reform with other policy priorities and to enable broad-based ownership of reform plans	
		Support the policy development process by drawing in on the knowledge of the domestic and international technical experts	
		Create a new independent agency with new rules and regulations	
Budget politics	Lack of clear delineation of responsibilities across government agencies, as consolidating pools requires redefinition of responsibilities	Mobilize support from healthcare providers who is in favour of the new agency	Mexico, Japan, Turkey
		Form an intergovernmental task force before the pooling reforms are discussed in the Legislature to coordinate reform related policy matters	
		Use technical analyses (e.g. budget projections, best practice examples from comparator countries) to ease budgetary concerns	
		Use societal/party values to highlight the normative importance of undertaking the reforms despite budgetary concerns	
	The Ministry of Finance controls the government budget and has the capacity to block consolidation of pools due to concerns over increased budgetary pressures and the expectation of rising costs	Build a reform team comprised of experts with strong technical knowledge, political skills and favourable personal relations with the heads of influential technical and political institutions, as well as politicians	
Leadership politics	Minister of Health is too weak to address opposition from within the ruling political party to pooling reform	Enable a public policy making process that will allow participation of interest groups in the design of the reform	Mexico, Turkey, Korea
		Engage the top-level political leadership's influence to enforce strict party discipline among party members in support of the reform	
		Position the reform as a central policy issue to garner votes and political support by directly tying policy with individual benefits	
		Use the President's election campaign platform to increase public visibility of health policy reforms	
	Resistance from the opposition parties to the ruling party's vision for the consolidation of pools	Use the party values/ideology/President's personal values (e.g. social solidarity) to inform the underlying approach to pooling reform	
		Sequence health reforms such that easily implementable-high visibility changes are adopted in the earlier reform stages to garner public support	
		Incorporate supporting interest groups into the policy development process by using their technical expertise and influence in the public sphere	
		Exert strong political will of the top-level politicians, including the President or the Prime Minister, to pass the pooling reform agenda	
Beneficiary politics	General public is disengaged from the highly technical pooling reform	Use party majority in the Legislature to pass laws	Ghana, Korea
		Use the President's election campaign platform to increase public visibility of health policy reforms	
		Reframe the public debate on the pooling reform as a crucial component of good governance, modernization of the nation, and benefits to individuals	
		Set up hot lines for citizens to address questions, concerns and complaints	
		Direct engagement with public through ministerial forums and town halls	
	Opposition parties garner public support for their vision of the pooling reforms	Highlight pooling reform as a political priority in the political manifesto and in the government's political agenda	
		Use favourable media coverage to mobilize support for the proposed pooling reforms from among the most disadvantaged groups of the population	
		Rapidly pass reforms in the Legislature before the new election cycle to pre-empt the efforts of the opposition	
External actor politics	The existing pooling arrangements are perceived as the legacy of external actors	Use media coverage to create a negative perception of the opposing political actors in the eye of the public	Ghana, Turkey
		Collaborate with international organizations with high technical expertise to demonstrate the deleterious impact of the existing pooling arrangements on health service utilization and financial risk protection	
	International organizations favour a different model of pooling reforms compared to the reform team	Use funding from international organizations to pilot different models of revenue pooling to determine which one works better given the country context	
		Facilitate an open dialogue with various international organizations that can contribute to the design, financing and development of the reform plans	

References

- Allen, R., Y. Hurcan, and M. Queyranne, The Evolving Functions and Organization of Finance Ministries. Public Budgeting & Finance, 2016. 36(4): p. 3-25.
- Anderson, I., et al., How can health ministries present persuasive investment plans for women's, children's and adolescents' health? Bulletin of the World Health Organization, 2016. 94(6): p. 468-474.
- Blanchet, N., G. Fink, and I. Osei-Akoto, The Effect of Ghana's National Health Insurance Scheme on Health Care Utilisation. Ghana Medical Journal, 2012. 46(2): p. 76-84.
- Bump, J.B. and S.P. Sparkes, A Political Economy Analysis of Turkey's Health Transformation Programme. 2014, The World Bank: Washington, DC.
- Cashin, C., et al., Aligning public financial management and health financing. 2017, World Health Organization: Geneva.
- Chi, Y.-L. and J.B. Bump, Resource allocation processes at multilateral organizations working in global health. Health policy and planning, 2018. 33(suppl_1): p. i4-i13.
- Fox, A.M. and M.R. Reich, The politics of universal health coverage in low-and middle-income countries: a framework for evaluation and action. Journal of health politics, policy and law, 2015. 40(5): p. 1023-1060.
- Frenk, J., O. Gómez-Dantés, and F.M. Knaul, The democratization of health in Mexico: financial innovations for universal coverage. Bulletin of the World Health Organization, 2009. 87: p. 542-548.
- Gómez-Dantés, O., M.R. Reich, and F. Garrido-Latorre, Political economy of pursuing the expansion of social protection in health in México. Health Systems & Reform, 2015. 1(3): p. 207-216.
- Kusi-Ampofo, O., et al., Resistance and change: a multiple streams approach to understanding health policy making in Ghana. Journal of health politics, policy and law, 2015. 40(1): p. 195-219.
- Kutzin, J., C. Cashin, and M. Jakab, Implementing Health Financing Reform: Lessons from Countries in Transition. 2010, European Observatory on Health Systems and Policies.
- Kwon, S., Healthcare financing reform and the new single payer system in the Republic of Korea: Social solidarity or efficiency? International Social Security Review, 2003. 56(1): p. 75-94.
- Kwon, S. and M.R. Reich, The changing process and politics of health policy in Korea. Journal of Health Politics, Policy and Law, 2005. 30(6): p. 1003-1026.
- Lakin, J.M., The possibilities and limitations of insurgent technocratic reform: Mexico's Popular Health Insurance Program, 2001-2006. 2008, Harvard University: Cambridge.
- Lakin, J., The End of Insurance: Mexico's Seguro Popular, 2001–2007. Journal of Health Politics Policy and Law, 2010. 35(3).
- Mahmood, S.A., et al., "Making Politics Work for Development: Harnessing Transparency and Citizen Engagement. 2018, World Bank Oxford, UK.
- Olson, M., The Logic of Collective Action: Public Goods and the Theory of Groups. 1965, Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Roberts, M., et al., Getting Health Reform Right: A Guide to Improving Performance and Equity. 2004, New York: Oxford University Press.
- Sparkes, S., J. Bump, and M. Reich, Political Strategies for Health Reform in Turkey: Extending Veto Point Theory. Health systems & Reform, 2015. 1(4).
- Singleton, J.L., Negotiating change: an analysis of the origins of Ghana's national health insurance act. 2006.