

Supporting Governments to Develop the Investment Case for NCDs and Tobacco Control

12-13 February 2018, WHO HQ Geneva: summary and actions

Summary

1. A first meeting of the group was held in January 2017. A second meeting was held on 12 February and the morning of 13 February, 2018. It was hosted by the Secretariat of the UN Interagency Task Force on NCDs. The purpose of the meeting was to review progress on investment cases to date and agree on next steps. The agenda and list of participants are included in [Annex 1](#) and [Annex 2](#), respectively.
2. Participants were updated on the work being done in the WHO to develop a Global Business Plan for NCDs, which will be published later in 2018. The Business Plan will include 84 low- and middle-income countries with results available at global and regional levels. The model used will include all sixteen Best Buys. The aim of the Business Plan is to demonstrate the enormous benefit from investing in NCDs. A plan for disseminating the report is being developed and was presented to meeting participants.
3. Those leading on the Global Business Plan would like to include a number of case studies from the countries that have had investment cases conducted. The group agreed that this would be helpful and be complementary as it is not planned to include country specific data in the model that is being used for the Global Business Plan.
4. Completed, ongoing and planned investment cases were reviewed ([Annex 3](#)). Eleven of these are being funded by the Russian Federation under the WHO-UNDP global joint programme on catalysing multisectoral action. For some of these investment cases multi-stakeholder forums have been held – and these were reviewed as well. A range of issues that had emerged from investment cases carried out to date included:
 - a. on the level of calculations and writing the report: the approach to informal work forces in the calculation; the inability to take the strength of enforcement of a policy into account in the OneHealth Tool (OHT); the high presenteeism costs in multiple cases; the relative high return on investment for salt interventions due to a positive estimation of the time line for effect caused by the lack of data. This could unintentionally avert country's focus from other interventions as tobacco control; the integration of the institutional context and economic analysis in the report;
 - b. on the level of presenting the outcomes of the report: explaining the concept of intangible costs to governments as well as differences in numbers between countries; the process of

receiving clearance from the government with regard to a high burden, outcomes that are not aligned with the political agenda and sensitivities in the institutional context analysis; the way the country uses the report for advocacy purposes.

5. An update on the WHO FCTC Secretariat-led tobacco control investment cases funded by the United Kingdom Government was provided ([Annex 4](#)). Two countries will receive NCD and tobacco control investment cases (Cambodia and Zambia). Although methodology differs slightly between the NCD and FCTC mission, the meeting agreed that this should not provide difficulties in terms of presentation. The importance of effective collaboration and synergy in conducting the two types of investment cases was highlighted by participants.
6. The January 2017 meeting agreed that a guidance note for NCD investment cases was to be developed. In February 2018, the meeting was updated that the guidance note was completed and being cleared across WHO, UNDP and the World Bank. It would be made available electronically on the web. It was agreed that the guidance note should be updated at regular intervals. Two appendices are being finalised to support the guidance note to provide technical details on the economic models used for an NCD investment case. Appendix 1 will explain how the costs and benefits of clinical and policy interventions are estimated in the OHT and NCD Costing Tool including the formulas used to monetize health benefits of interventions. Appendix 2 will be a step by step user's guide to the NCD Impact Module of the OHT and an excel-based dual economic impact and return on investment model.
7. The meeting agreed that a Q&A should be developed to respond to FAQ regarding the methodology of the investment cases and interpretation of results (e.g. selection of NCD interventions, comparability between case studies, how to interpret the results, what to do with the results). The Q&A would be aimed at policy makers and like the guidance note should be updated regularly. A second Q&A should respond to FAQ for economists (e.g. issues around data sources, health accounts, health system spending, international proxy data, calculation of presenteeism and absenteeism, and use of DALYs).
8. There was discussion around methodology with regards the human capital approach (HCA) vs. the frictional approach (FA). HCA results in significantly higher burden of disease. In general, ministries of health prefer HCA, as this is more powerful for advocacy purposes. It was agreed that the default for the investment cases should be to use HCA. Where countries wished to use FA this could be accommodated. However, a full explanation would be given by the team conducting the investment case as to why HCA was the preferred approach. Conducting both approaches was not recommended as this would be confusing. There was also a discussion on discounting. Discounting has been done in all investment cases to date and should be continued to be done for all future investment cases.
9. The group discussed the pros and cons of having one template for investment case reports. It was agreed not to have one in order to have reports tailored to the needs and context of specific

countries. Nevertheless the meeting agreed that those conducting future investment cases should review previous reports and then agree on the one that they would use as example in consultation with WHO and UNDP. A key lesson learned was the need for the lead economist to work more closely with the individual leading the work on the institutional context analysis (ICA), ahead and during the mission, as well as when drafting the report. Although only a limited amount of material from the ICA would find its way into the final investment case report, it is important that the ICA material is fully integrated and not just added on at the end of the report: both the economic and institutional context analyses should be equal drivers of the conclusions of the investment case.

10. There was discussion around the OHT. While limitations were acknowledged by participants, it was agreed that the OHT should continue to be used for all NCD investment cases. Nevertheless, participants agreed that it would be helpful to enhance the NCD elements of the OHT and that additional funding should therefore be sought for this purpose.
11. The meeting was updated on the investment case training seminar that was conducted for economists in Moscow during September 2017 and that there had been a small amount of training on OHT during the seminar. Videos of the training provided in Moscow are available on the Task Force YouTube site. Some participants asked for these videos to be reviewed to ensure there was no sensitive information on the recordings. It was agreed that this would be done.
12. The meeting was updated on plans in March 2018 for a five-day seminar specifically devoted to the OHT. The training could cover the full OHT with NCD specific examples. The last day would include ICA and NCD excel models. The skills of the participants would be tested at the end of the course. The trainings would also be a mechanism building capacity amongst those attending to train others in their region. Recording the seminar was to be considered.
13. Participants agreed that it was important to publish the results of investment cases in peer-reviewed publication. To date, only the investment case for Jamaica has plans for publication, being led by RTI with co-authors across the group. It was agreed that a publication strategy should be developed.
14. The meeting concluded with discussion on how countries are taking forward NCD work following the investment case. Engagement of the UN Country Team in this process was considered important. To date only a small number of investment case forums have happened: further experience would help identify effective ways forward.
15. It was agreed that the Task Force Secretariat should look to host a further meeting of the group in a year's time.

Actions

1. Those leading the Global Business Plan to come back to the group as soon as possible with requests for inputs from the group in order to include country investment case studies into the repost and electronic platform share: ideas and requests to be articulated to the group (Mary-Ann Land and others leading on the Global Business Plan).
2. Follow up with countries that have received final investment case reports on the impact that these reports have made (Task Force Secretariat and UNDP colleagues).
3. Technical FAQ/Q&A document for economists to be created (James Murray and Rachel Nugent to lead with input from Anna Kontsevaya, Melanie Bertram and Karin Stenberg).
4. General FAQ/Q&A document for policy makers to be developed (Dudley Tarlton and Nick Banatvala to lead with input from Alexey Kulikov, Jill Farrington, Melanie Bertram and others).
5. OneHealth Tool: short proposal for funding compiled for developing the OHT for NCDs, with efforts to mobilise resources for this work (Brian Hutchinson and Melanie Bertram to lead with input from Karin Stenberg, Nick Banatvala and others).
6. Flow chart/check list to be developed (building on existing UNDP material) to bring the ICA and economic analysis together at all stages of the investment case (from preparation to follow up, Dudley Tarlton to lead with input from Alexey Kulikov and James Murray).
7. Publication strategy to be developed (Rachel Nugent to lead with input from Alexey Kulikov, Dudley Tarlton, Nick Banatvala and others).
8. Develop ever more effective ways for sharing information, reports etc. (SharePoint etc., Task Force Secretariat).
9. Follow up meeting early 2019 (Task Force Secretariat)

14 March 2018

oooOOOooo

Annex 1. Agenda

DAY 1: Monday 12 February 2017

09:00-09:15	Welcome and introductions, expected purpose and outcomes of the meeting (Nick Banatvala, Dudley Tarlton)
09:15-10:15	Setting the scene <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Roadmap for the Third High-level Meeting on NCDs (Menno van Hilten) The Global Business Plan – aims and objectives, process and timeframe (Etienne Krug/ Douglas Bettcher) Incorporating country investment case studies into a Global Business Plan (Gini Arnold/ Mary Anne Land) Overview of investment cases done to date, progress on those underway, timeline for future investment cases (Alexey Kulikov) A brief update on the FCTC CS-led tobacco control investment cases (Vera daCosta e Silva and Dudley Tarlton) WHO, UNDP and WB quality control mechanisms (Melanie Bertram, Dudley Tarlton, Julius Korir)
10:15-10:45	<i>Coffee Break</i>
10:45-11:30	NCD Investment Case Guidance <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Issues that require clarification (James Murray and Melanie Bertram) Guidance being developed for the FCTC-led tobacco control investment cases, and NCDs & indoor air pollution (Dudley Tarlton) Training and capacity building for investment case economists (Alexey Kulikov and Melanie Bertram)
Review of the 11 investment cases conducted to date (Barbados, Belarus, Fiji, Jamaica, Kenya, Kyrgyzstan, Mongolia, Peru, Turkey, Uzbekistan, Viet Nam)	
11:30-12:30	Group 1: Fiji 11.30-11.50; Kenya 11.50-12.10; Turkey 12.10-12.30.
12:30-13:30	<i>Lunch</i>
13:30-14:30	Group 2: Mongolia 13.30-13.50; Viet Nam 13.50-14.10; Peru 14.10-14.30.
14:30-14:45	<i>Mini-Break</i>
14:45-15:45	Group 3: Uzbekistan 14.45-15.05; Jamaica 15.05-15.25; Kyrgyzstan 15.25-15.45.
15:45-16:15	<i>Coffee</i>
16:15-16:55	Group 4: Belarus 16.15-16.35; Barbados 16.35-16.55.

DAY 2: Tuesday 13 February 2018

09:00-10:45	Bringing it together <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Common issues, challenges, messages and narrative emerging • How to incorporate case studies into the Global Business Plan • Peer-review publication strategy • Do we now have one agreed methodology for NCD investment cases? • Coordination and collaboration with the tobacco investment case and indoor air pollution work
10:45-11:15	<i>Coffee break</i>
11:15-12:00	Investment case forums <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Approach, outcomes and lessons learnt • What happens after a forum <p>Alexey Kulikov followed by a round table discussion</p>
12:00-13:00	Agreed actions and next steps

Country presentations

The lead economist (with support from UNDP on the institutional context analysis) on each investment case will present findings in 5 slides. Issues of clarification and discussion will then follow. 20 minutes is allocated for each case study (8-10 mins for the presentation, 10-12 minutes for the discussion).

- Slides 1-2: key findings and messages that could be included as a case study for a global business case (one slide on economics and one slides on institutional context analysis);
- Slide 3: limitations of the study;
- Slide 4 areas where the investment case approach differed significantly from the approach set out in the guidance note;
- Slide 5: explanation of any differences in approach and significance in interpreting the results.

Country	Lead presenter (economist)	Supporting comments on the ICA
Barbados	Melanie Bertram	Doug Webb*
Belarus	Anna Kontsevaya	Doug Webb*
Fiji	Marj Moodie*	Dudley Tarlton
Jamaica	Brian Hutchinson	Roy Small*
Kenya	Julius Korir	Not applicable
Kyrgyzstan	Anna Kontsevaya	Doug Webb*
Mongolia	Rachel Nugent	Dudley Tarlton
Peru	Brian Hutchinson	Pallavi Yagnik*
Turkey	Anna Kontsevaya	Not done
Uzbekistan	Anna Kontsevaya	Roy Small*
Viet Nam	James Murray	Not done

* Joining by phone.

Annex 2. List of participants

NHMRC Centre for Research Excellence in Obesity Policy and Food Systems - Centre for Population Health Research, Melbourne

Marj Moodie*

Head, Deakin Health Economics

Email: marj.moodie@deakin.edu.au

National Research Centre for Preventative Medicine of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Russian Federation, Moscow

Anna Kontsevaya

Head of Research Laboratory

Email: koncanna@yandex.ru

Organization Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD)

Andrea Fiegl*

Email: andrea.FEIGL@oecd.org

RTI International, Seattle

Brian Hutchinson

Research Public Health Analyst

Email: bhutchinson@rti.org

Rachel Nugent

Vice President

Email: rnugent@rti.org

United Nations Development Programme (UNDP)

Dudley Tarlton

Programme Specialist, Health and Development

Email: dudley.tarlton@undp.org

Douglas Webb*

Team Leader, Health and Innovative Financing

Email: douglas.webb@undp.org

Elfatih Abdelraheem

HIV, Health and Development Policy Specialist and Team Leader for Arab States

Email: elfatih.abdelraheem@undp.org

Pallavi Yagnik*

Health Specialist, Health and Innovative Financing

Email: pallavi.yagnik@undp.org

Roy Small*

Policy Analyst, Health and Innovative Financing

Email: roy.small@undp.org

Independent Consultants

David Tordrup

Email: dtordrup@gmail.com

James Murray

Email: james.murray@barcelonagse.eu

Julius Korir

Email: jkorir1@gmail.com

World Health Organization (WHO), Headquarters

Alexey Kulikov

Email: kulikova@who.int

External Relations Officer, UNIATF, NCDs and Mental Health

Anton Hasselgren

Email: hasselgrena@who.int

Intern, UNIATF, NCDs and Mental Health

Cherian Varghese

Email: varghesec@who.int

Coordinator, Management of Noncommunicable Diseases

Douglas Bettcher

Email: bettcherd@who.int

Director, Prevention of Noncommunicable Diseases

Emily Wymer

Email : wymere@who.int

Technical Officer, Prevention of Noncommunicable Diseases

Fiona Bull

Email: bullf@who.int

Programme Manager, Prevention of Noncommunicable Diseases

Jeremias Paul Jr

Email: pauli@who.int

Coordinator, Tobacco Control Economics

Karin Stenberg

Email: stenbergk@who.int

Technical Officer, Economic Analysis and Evaluation, Health Systems Governance and Financing

Maartje Stutvoet

Email: stutvoetm@who.int

Intern, UNIATF, NCDs and Mental Health

Mary-Anne Land

Email: landm@who.int

Technical Officer, NVI Management of NCDs, Disability, Violence & Injury Prevention

Menno Van Hilten

Email: vanhiltenm@who.int

Senior External Relations Officer, NCDs and Mental Health

Melanie Bertram

Email: bertramm@who.int

Technical Officer, Economics Analysis and Evaluation, Health Systems Governance and Financing

Nick Banatvala (NB)

Email: banatvalan@who.int

Head of Secretariat, UNIATF, NCDs and Mental Health

Robert Totanes

Email: totanesr@who.int

Technical Officer, Tobacco Control Economics

Shekhar Saxena

Email: saxenas@who.int

Director, Mental Health and Substance Abuse

Suvi Harmala

Email: harmalas@who.int

Intern, NVI Management of NCDs, Disability, Violence & Injury Prevention

Vinayak Mohan Prasad

Email: prasadvi@who.int

Programme Manager, National Capacity, Prevention of Noncommunicable Diseases

Virginia Arnold

Email: arnoldv@who.int

Project Officer, Prevention of Noncommunicable Diseases

[WHO Regional Office for Europe](#)

Jill Farrington (JF)

Email: farringtonj@who.int

Coordinator, NCDs and Promoting Health through the Life-Course

* joining by phone

Annex 3. Overview of Investment Case Countries

COUNTRIES BEING DISCUSSED

COUNTRIES BEING DISCUSSED	STATUS
Barbados	Completed
Belarus ^R	Report completed, QC by EURO, being shared with Government for comment.
Fiji	Presented and accepted by Government - QCed here in Geneva
Jamaica	Draft presented, with Government for comment, not QCed here in Geneva
Kenya	Being led by the World Bank
Kyrgyzstan ^R	Completed
Mongolia	Completed
Peru	Report being prepared
Saudi Arabia*	Report being prepared
Turkey	Report with MoH for comment, QC by EURO
Uzbekistan ^R	Report being prepared
Viet Nam	Reported finished, awaiting QC and presentation to government

PIPELINE COUNTRIES

Armenia ^R	Dates confirmed
Cambodia ^{+R}	Awaiting dates
DRC ^R	Dates being negotiated
Ethiopia	Being led by the World Bank
Ghana	Being led by the World Bank
Kazakhstan ^R	Dates confirmed
Iran ^R	Awaiting dates
Nicaragua ^R	Awaiting dates
Oman*	Awaiting confirmation of resources from Government
Philippines ^R	Dates confirmed
Zambia ^{+R}	Process started

Abbreviations: QC is quality control, MoH is ministry of health, EURO is World Health Organization Regional Office for Europe.

* Funded by the country itself. ^R Funded by the Russian Federation. ⁺ Joint NCD and tobacco investment case countries

Annex 4. WHO FCTC Secretariat-led tobacco control investment cases

The following WHO FCTC Secretariat-led tobacco control investment cases are planned for 2018 and 2019. These are being funded by the United Kingdom:

Cambodia*
Cape Verde
Chad
Colombia
Egypt
El Salvador
Georgia
Jordan
Madagascar
Myanmar
Nepal
Samoa
Sierra Leone
Sri Lanka
Zambia*

*NCD investment case being conducted as well.